

Belonging: PAFA Becomes a Pluralistic Community



Willie Birch, *A Farwell Feast...*, 1988, gouache on paper with paper-mâché frame, 37 7/16 x 49 5/8 in., The Harold A. and Ann R. Sorgenti Collection of Contemporary African-American Art, © 1988 Willie Birch, 2004.207

PAFA

Pennsylvania Academy
of the Fine Arts

Diversity to Belonging: PAFA Becomes a Pluralistic Community

Campus climate is “the total effect of the environment—institutional and community—that influences the experience of those who work and study at the college or university...campus climate is about perception—about how it feels to be in that community, not simply what happens.”

(National Institute of Independent Colleges and Universities, 1991, p. 2)

The social and racial unrest that erupted across the country this year has been a wake-up call for many and a stark reminder that our society—and our PAFA community—have not lived up to our ideals on life, liberty, and equality. PAFA is at an inflection point. As an institution of higher learning that helps to cultivate minds through art, PAFA has an obligation and an opportunity to take a more active role in this process: to call out discrimination when we see it, to recognize implicit bias, and to work towards dismantling systems of oppression from our institution and our community.

Internally, we have to demand of ourselves a better commitment to live the values of social justice and equity that we want in the world. We cannot be a world-renowned institute of art without ensuring that every experience at PAFA matches the words in our mission and core values. We assert that PAFA must encourage a respect for cultural pluralism and diversity in which each racial and ethnic group is seen as having the right to express a distinctive culture, and in which this expression is viewed as an enriching contribution to the larger national culture. We all must strive towards greater cultural humility by expanding our sense of connection, inclusion, and belonging across differences. In support of the strategic plan’s diversity goals, President David Brigham charged the formation of a task force focused on diversity and inclusion. In February 2019, the Vice President of Human Resources named PAFA’s first Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Task Force, BELONGING, to honor the belief that people should not only have a voice but also recognize that their individuality contributes to the intricate tapestry of the artistic, intellectual, creative work that constitutes the PAFA community. BELONGING’s members—comprised of staff, faculty, and students—were charged with developing actions that can have immediate, short-term, and long-term impact and ensure that PAFA lives up to its ideals of being a diverse and inclusive community. These members galvanized their experiences, hopes, and disappointments into a transformative agenda that promotes a safe and meaningful learning and work environment at PAFA.

In March 2019, we asked for perceptions of PAFA’s climate and support level for diversity and equity during the 2018-19 academic year. From March 1-March 31, 2019, 412 of our faculty, staff, and students were invited to participate in the survey. Of those invited, 46% participated. Overall, 71% of employees responded, and 31% of students completed the

Higher Education Data Sharing Consortium (HEDS) Diversity and Equity Campus Climate survey. Recently, the Association of Independent Colleges of Art & Design (AICAD) announced that members are planning to participate in the HEDS Diversity and Equity Campus Climate Survey during the 2020-21 academic year.

The HEDS Diversity and Equity Campus Climate Survey asked students, faculty, staff, and administrators about their perceptions against three indicators: 1) campus climate, 2) support for diversity and equity, and 3) experiences with discrimination and harassment at PAFA.

There was overall satisfaction for PAFA’s campus climate. 71% of students and 55% of employees responded to being satisfied with the overall campus climate, while 47% of students and 54% of employees answered that they experienced a sense of belonging. One of PAFA’s primary strengths is our community—the people who work, study, teach, mentor, and otherwise help fulfill our mission. When our community is engaged and empowered, we have the potential to realize the best version of this institution. However, as our community grows and evolves, failure to embrace new voices and attitudes can leave people disengaged and undervalued, which negatively affects our campus climate and culture.

Regarding the questions on the support of diversity and equity at PAFA, student responses indicated a satisfaction level of 63% and employees 41%. The data highlighted that we still have important work to do with ensuring students see more of themselves reflected in the senior administration and the faculty. Concerns were raised that senior leadership did not model diversity and inclusion in terms of communication and accountability, and that the recruitment and retention of historically marginalized students, staff, and particularly faculty should be an institutional priority.

We have changed our faculty hiring practices from posting internally and word of mouth to national searches by which we ask candidates to indicate their accomplishments in, and commitments to, advancing diversity, equity and inclusion, and their teaching philosophy and pedagogy. The result has been more competitive pools, larger numbers of highly qualified candidates, and more diverse hiring outcomes in those selected to begin working at PAFA in the fall of 2020 in student services positions and appointed faculty roles.

Of the 188 respondents to the survey, 24% reported that they had experienced discrimination and harassment at some point during the previous year. We launched in October 2019 a new confidential web-based reporting system partly due to the feedback in this area of the survey. Each instance of discrimination or harassment, the effects that begin with the people directly involved, extends to social networks, and shared academic groups, ultimately impacting the PAFA community. We are committed to respect, equity, and safety. One of our goals has already been fulfilled: the hire of an emotionally intelligent, academically prepared and skilled diversity, equity, inclusion, and belonging expert with Title IX experience.

Additionally, we recognize that situations may arise when a student or member of our faculty or staff may be reluctant to report what they saw or know out of fear of reprisal or retaliation. In those instances, PAFA has selected EthicsPoint, an external third-party to provide 24 hours a day, seven days a week in a confidential setting without fear of reprisal by either dialing (844) 796-6532 or by visiting the website, <http://pafa.ethicspoint.com/>.

PAFA has subscribed to an online training platform that will enable us to ensure that every student, faculty member, and staff member receives annual training in Title IX, Clery Act, Diversity and Inclusion, and FERPA (Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act). Completion of this training is now a condition of employment and will also be required for students. The Vice President of Human Resources, who is also PAFA's Title IX Coordinator and is certified in that role by ATIXA, has completed additional Title IX training in January 2020 and July 2020. The Dean of Students and the Dean of the School have also completed training in handling Title IX complaints and resulting disciplinary processes.

BELONGING examined the HEDS results, best practices of peer institutions, national trends, and ideas gained from their conversations with students, faculty, and staff to improve each area. We have outlined actions to inform and improve the support, policies, and practices at PAFA, which have been adopted by our board. The diversity statement we drafted was adopted by the board in March 2020. It is not intended to be

a non-performative statement, but our collective clarion call to action to ensure our faculty, staff, and students are valued as individuals regardless of their color, age, ethnicity, gender, sexual identity, and lived experiences—that's what makes us stronger.

The cover of this report, by Willie Birch, was selected from the PAFA Museum collection by BELONGING in the fall semester of 2019. Birch is an African-American artist who conceptualizes people not as monotypes but holistically. His piece visually represents our shared future and vision for PAFA and our nation. We strive to create a proverbial table as a safe space where people gather with the confidence that they can express themselves authentically. This is what it means to feel that you belong, are welcomed, and are a contributing member of a pluralistic community.

This is our opportunity, and this our commitment to make PAFA better.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa Biagas, chair of BELONGING and Members of the Task Force:

Laura Beard
Nat Bombeke, 2019-20 Student Diversity Ambassador
Al Gury, new member for AY 2020-21
Darla Jackson, new member for AY 2020-21
Anna Marley
Ronke Oke, new member for AY 2020-21
Bhoomi Patel, 2019-20 Student Diversity Ambassador
Kevin Richards
CJ Stahl
Maria Teicher-Dougherty, new member for AY 2020-21
Judith Thomas
Hoang Tran
Brittany Webb

Looking Inward

The HEDS Diversity and Equity Campus Climate Survey was chosen after an exhaustive review of climate surveys. HEDS is a consortium of liberal arts colleges and universities with enrollment under 500 students. As PAFA is a museum and a college, it was important to find a survey tool that would consider the perspective of the students, who form the largest constituent group within PAFA. The HEDS Diversity and Equity Campus Climate Survey asks students, faculty, staff, and administrators about their:

- Perceptions of their institution's climate;
- Perceptions of how their institution supports diversity and equity; and
- Perceptions of potential experiences with discrimination and harassment at their institution.

Survey Methods, Timeline, and Participation

While awaiting survey results from the March 2019 survey, BELONGING conducted a diversity audit and inventory. BELONGING was divided into three workgroups -- representing each constituency and based on the overarching themes in the areas of concern -- to analyze the data, research best practices, and propose recommendations for improvement.

Although PAFA pursued this survey in an effort to develop a deep understanding of the community's perspectives and experiences related to diversity, equity, and inclusion, there are a few limitations to note. Due to the nature of the survey, participants were not required to answer all the questions. Participants could choose to skip any question they did not wish to answer, resulting in the data sets varying by question.

Who Participated

Campus-wide, 412 staff, faculty, and students were invited to participate in the survey. Of those invited to participate, 46% responded. Overall, 71% of employees responded, and 31% of students completed the survey. Of the students who responded, 68% were undergraduates, and 33% were graduates. Demographically, of those participants who responded to the question about gender, 60% identified as female, 36% as male, and 4% as non-binary. For those participants who answered the question about race and ethnicity, 62% of students and 23% of staff identified as belonging to one or more historically marginalized groups.

Findings

For our purposes, campus climate specifically pertains to perception; how it feels to be in our community, not merely what happens. We consider campus climate to be closely related to organizational culture, which includes the deeply held values, beliefs, and meanings embraced and communicated by an organization.

Overall, PAFA's first campus climate and culture survey is generally strong, specifically in the areas of our connection to our mission, spirit of diversity and inclusion, and overall experience. However, we also found that our organization has some work to do in bolstering our culture and increasing our focus on inclusion. While change is usually not easy, the incentive to review this feedback in an open-minded way holds the promise of great rewards, strengthening our community, and helping PAFA achieve our goals and excel in our mission.

In summary, our most notable themes in our findings can be broken down as follows:

Communication

Administration, staff, faculty, and students all expressed a need for improved communication, greater transparency, and more inclusive processes across all functions. BELONGING recommends that PAFA develop multi-tiered communication vehicles, including those that will foster two-way communications among all components of the campus community. Doing so will allow the organization to capture invaluable feedback and ideas that can make PAFA stronger.

Equity

There are concerns regarding fairness, specifically related to issues of compensation, accountability, and performance management. Many report feeling unappreciated, that their contributions are not valued, and that they are not sufficiently recognized/respected. BELONGING suggests that PAFA creates a compensation program that may employ rewards that include and extend beyond salary. By taking note of what is important to employees, PAFA can improve hiring and retention efforts while remaining within its operational budget. Additionally, creating a Professional Development Program will address the needs of all employees; a commitment to its execution can be evidenced by the inclusion of professional development throughout the budgetary process. As an institution of higher learning, we can use what we know to help all employees grow in their roles, which can make PAFA stronger and more effective.

Leadership

Faculty and staff report varying degrees of alignment across departments and varying degrees of skill/effectiveness across different leadership levels. BELONGING recommends that PAFA adopt a Leadership Competency Model. The adopted model should be employed at all levels of leadership, beginning with the president and the senior team, and extending to the departmental leaders. Such a model will help leaders grow in their roles and ensure alignment and greater effectiveness across all of the organization's leadership roles. Throughout the entire survey, BELONGING

observed that “non-committal”—“neither satisfied nor dissatisfied”— answers were consistently high. This perhaps indicates institutional fatigue or complacency. Participants in the survey also conveyed to BELONGING that they did not believe that the survey was truly confidential. There is, therefore, a possible wariness around the survey, too. However, building on the deep commitment of employees and students to PAFA’s mission, BELONGING sees an opportunity to build the trust of the “non-committed” respondents in order to engage PAFA’s community so that everyone feels invested.

current state of PAFA’s climate. Of the respondents, 71% of students and 55% of employees reported being satisfied with the overall campus climate (Table 1) while 47% of students and 54% of employees answered that they experienced a sense of belonging (Table 2). These results reflect BELONGING’s observation of a deep connection to PAFA’s mission and pride in PAFA’s history and facilities.

The survey had two primary purposes: to prioritize areas of concern and to establish baseline metrics. Participants were asked questions about their personal experiences in the college as they relate to diversity, equity, and inclusion. However, it is important to note that not all those who responded answered all the questions. Below is a discussion of the survey’s three indicators.

Campus Climate Indicator

BELONGING observed that morale is low. When there are concerns regarding morale, there can be a tendency to focus on the lowest scoring statements and/or survey dimensions. That kind of analysis is indeed important; however, when done in isolation, it does not present a complete picture of the

Although the “satisfaction” response was high on the question of overall campus climate, BELONGING is concerned to see that approximately one quarter of students and employees did not commit to being either “satisfied” or “dissatisfied” (Table 1). Indeed, throughout the entire survey, “neutral”—“neither satisfied nor dissatisfied”— answers were consistently high (Tables 1–9). BELONGING interprets the collectively high “neither satisfied nor dissatisfied” response as possibly indicating institutional weariness or apathy, as well as a wariness that the survey would not result in concrete action. However, BELONGING also sees the collective response as an opportunity to instigate positive, meaningful action and to help guide the “neutral” responses into the “satisfied” category. Additionally, 22% of employees recorded that they were dissatisfied with the overall campus climate (Table 1). This was also the case for experiencing a sense of belonging: 29% of students and 19% of employees were neither satisfied nor dissatisfied and approximately one quarter of students

Table 1		STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES	
		n	%	n	%
Please indicate your level of satisfaction with the following at PAFA (Q1)					
Overall campus climate.	Very satisfied	17	22%	14	14%
	Generally satisfied	39	49%	40	41%
	Neither satisfied nor dissatisfied	17	22%	22	22%
	Generally dissatisfied	5	6%	20	20%
	Very dissatisfied	1	1%	2	2%
	Total	79	100%	98	100%

Table 2		STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES	
		n	%	n	%
Please indicate your level of satisfaction with the following at PAFA (Q1)					
The extent to which you experience a sense of belonging or community at PAFA.	Very satisfied	17	22%	15	15%
	Generally satisfied	20	25%	39	39%
	Neither satisfied nor dissatisfied	23	29%	19	19%
	Generally dissatisfied	15	19%	20	20%
	Very dissatisfied	4	5%	7	7%
	Total	79	100%	100	100%

and employees do not experience a sense of belonging or community at PAFA (Table 2). Survey respondents were asked whether people of different roles and identities are treated equitably in the college. When participants were asked if they believed that all community members experience a sense of belonging and community at PAFA, 46% of students and 31% of employees responded that they were satisfied (Table 3).

However, 35% of students and 23% of employees were neither satisfied nor dissatisfied and 46% of employees were dissatisfied with the sense of belonging for all members of the PAFA community (Table 3).

Diversity and Equity Indicator

With regard to the campus experience and environment pertaining to diversity at PAFA, student responses indicated

a satisfaction level of 63% and employees 41%. Again, BELONGING observed that the “neither satisfied nor dissatisfied” response was high: 19% of students and 25% of employees. Among employees, 33% responded to being dissatisfied with the campus experience regarding diversity (Table 4).

A deeper probing of diversity and equity identified a lapse in institutional and senior leadership’s commitment to diversity and equity: 58% of students and 44% of employees. BELONGING noted that student and employee respondents differ in their perception of senior leadership’s commitment to diversity and equity; while 58% of students report seeing senior staff demonstrate commitments to diversity and equity, 56% of employees have differing degrees of not seeing these values demonstrated (Table 5). It may be helpful to note the extent to which these respondents are exposed to senior staff

Table 3		STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES	
		n	%	n	%
Please indicate your level of satisfaction with the following at PAFA (Q1)					
The extent to which you feel all community members experience a sense of belonging or community at PAFA.	Very satisfied	11	14%	7	7%
	Generally satisfied	25	32%	24	24%
	Neither satisfied nor dissatisfied	28	35%	23	23%
	Generally dissatisfied	14	18%	35	35%
	Very dissatisfied	1	1%	11	11%
	Total	79	100%	100	100%

Table 4		STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES	
		n	%	n	%
Please indicate your level of satisfaction with the following at PAFA (Q1)					
The campus experience/environment regarding diversity at PAFA.	Very satisfied	16	20%	13	13%
	Generally satisfied	34	43%	28	28%
	Neither satisfied nor dissatisfied	15	19%	25	25%
	Generally dissatisfied	9	11%	29	29%
	Very dissatisfied	5	6%	4	4%
	Total	79	100%	99	100%

Table 5		STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES	
		n	%	n	%
Please indicate your level of agreement with each of the following statements about PAFA (Q2)					
Senior leadership demonstrates a commitment to diversity and equity on this campus.	Strongly agree	17	22%	14	14%
	Agree	28	36%	30	30%
	Neither agree nor disagree	19	24%	27	27%
	Disagree	12	15%	19	19%
	Strongly disagree	2	3%	10	10%
	Total	78	100%	100	100%

Table 6	STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES		
	n	%	n	%	
Please indicate your level of agreement with each of the following statements about PAFA (Q2)					
Recruitment of historically marginalized students, faculty, and staff is an institutional priority.	Strongly agree	17	22%	10	10%
	Agree	32	41%	44	44%
	Neither agree nor disagree	18	23%	32	32%
	Disagree	8	10%	8	8%
	Strongly disagree	4	5%	6	6%
	Total	79	100%	100	100%

Table 7	STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES		
	n	%	n	%	
Please indicate your level of agreement with each of the following statements about PAFA (Q2)					
Retention of historically marginalized students, faculty, and staff is an institutional priority.	Strongly agree	14	18%	11	11%
	Agree	24	31%	18	18%
	Neither agree nor disagree	21	27%	35	35%
	Disagree	15	19%	27	27%
	Strongly disagree	4	5%	8	8%
	Total	78	100%	99	100%

members. Students may primarily be exposed to the deans of the school, but not other senior staff members. Employees, on the other hand, may have a clearer understanding of the senior staff as a team.

Specific comments about whether senior leadership demonstrates a commitment to diversity and equity included the following:

It doesn't. One senior administrator talks about diversity and inclusion, but his actions—particularly the retention of certain Senior Staff members, as well as deeply problematic faculty members—speak otherwise.

For the most part, I think PAFA attracts great employees that are dedicated and passionate. However, I've been seeing a lot of employees lose their passion quickly and lose focus on the institution's mission. Since we work in a small/medium nonprofit, it is imperative that employees feel committed to their work and that their work provides value and moves the institution's mission forward.

So far, the word Diversity has most often been raised by Leadership when they can't escape the effect their lack of diversity has on their image or when exploiting statistics/opportunities to make them appear diverse.

The institutional priority of recruiting historically marginalized students, faculty, and staff is recognized by 54% of employees and 63% of students (Table 6); however,

student perception of PAFA's retention efforts is much higher than that of employees (Table 7). BELONGING noted that employees who do not work in the school might not necessarily be as aware of retention efforts as students, faculty, and the school administration.

Comments specific to retention of a diverse PAFA community included the following:

Time, people, and funds need to be better managed. PAFA needs to reconcile its increasingly aggressive programming aspirations with the reality that its employees are already overworked, understaffed, and poorly compensated.

If you want to retain students from a diversity of backgrounds, you need to allocate more funds for scholarships and housing opportunities for students from marginalized groups. If you want a diverse staff then you have to make staff feel included. New voices are welcome and do not threaten those who are already here. I would suggest that PAFA suspend spending on all unnecessary capital and development initiatives, and reallocate those funds to a robust DEI initiative. If we cannot attract and retain students and support staff, there is no hope for this institution. It needs not a rebranding, but a reimagining of what we do, how we do it, and for whom we do it. The current model is unsustainable.

Tensions in relation to individual or group differences were widely acknowledged to exist, with employees responding at

55% and students at 39% (Table 8).

Respondents reported concerns about the hierarchical structure of the organization and poor channels of communication between the administration and the staff, faculty, and students, especially as it pertains to cross-functional communication:

Senior staff operates in a vacuum. This is particularly challenging for mid-level managers with supervisory responsibilities. This does not foster an inclusive climate and creates an “us vs. them” dynamic.

What happens at senior staff meetings? How are decisions made? What are justifications for reassessing projects mid-stream? Why are priorities changed? Communicating answers to staff for all these things would help greatly. Morale is low across campus and people do not feel included. With low resources people constantly feel that they are set up to fail or not do the best possible job.

The PAFA top-down approach, and single-minded focus on enrollment and revenue, does not foster a climate of open communication.

Discrimination/Harassment

Respondents who said they had witnessed or experienced discrimination were asked to write a narrative description of the events. These were classified into different types. If individuals reported more than one event or situation, it was assigned to each appropriate category. Of the 188 respondents to this survey, 24% reported that they had experienced discrimination and harassment at some point during the last year (Table 9). Nearly 70% of respondents who identify with a race not listed in the survey answered “yes” to having been discriminated against or harassed on the PAFA campus or an affiliated off-campus setting. One quarter of Black respondents and 43% of non-binary respondents answered “yes” to having been discriminated against or harassed on the PAFA campus or an affiliated off-campus setting.

Instances of harassment and discrimination are not reported due to a sense that no action will be taken or that the reporter would be retaliated against; i.e., further marginalization or job loss (Table 10). Cumulatively, 64% of students reported that they are uncertain or do not know how to report an act of discrimination or harassment. Less than one third of students agreed that the process for investigating acts of discrimination or harassment is clear.

Table 8		STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES	
		n	%	n	%
Please indicate your level of agreement with each of the following statements about PAFA (Q2)					
The campus environment is free from tensions in relation to individual or group differences.	Strongly agree	17	22%	8	8%
	Agree	17	22%	22	22%
	Neither agree nor disagree	14	18%	15	15%
	Disagree	27	34%	44	44%
	Strongly disagree	4	5%	11	11%
	Total	79	100%	100	100%

Table 9		STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES	
		n	%	n	%
Have you ever been discriminated against or harassed on the PAFA campus, at an off-campus residence, or at an off campus program/event affiliated with PAFA? (Q13)					
	Yes	20	25%	24	24%
	No	47	59%	67	67%
	Unsure	13	16%	9	9%
	Total	80	100%	100	100%
You indicated that you have experienced discrimination or harassment during your time at PAFA. Did any of these incidents of discrimination or harassment at PAFA occur in the last year? (Q15)					
<i>Respondents who selected “Yes” for Question 13 saw Question 15.</i>					
	Yes	15	75%	13	54%
	No	5	25%	11	46%
	Total	20	100%	24	100%

Table 10		STUDENTS		EMPLOYEES	
		n	%	n	%
Did you report an incident(s) to campus officials? (Q19)					
Respondents who selected “Yes” for Question 15 saw Question 19.					
	Yes	6	40%	3	23%
	No	9	60%	10	77%
	Total	15	100%	13	100%

Table 11					
Geographic location of small schools					
16	Northeastern		5	Northwestern	
13	Midwestern		2	Southwestern	
7	Southern		2	Western	

Respondents commented that, prior to the arrival of the current Vice President of Human Resources, the role had been too focused on protecting the institution from instances of liability, and not focused on creating systems of accountability and support for employees and students. Comments included the following:

Continual examples of harassment and belittling go unreported because PAFA displays indifferent solutions—both to the staff at large and to those that have made previous reports . . . PAFA’s administration relies on employee turnover to diffuse institutional memory or they become minimally reactive.

[PAFA needs] clear reporting, investigative and judicial procedures for Title VII discrimination and a process of tracking complaints. More training for faculty with clearly stated and enacted consequences for discriminatory actions

Supplemental Questions

Survey participants were asked three open-ended supplemental survey questions designed to measure their assessment of leadership’s commitment to DEI, solicit suggestions for activities and systems to foster DEI, as well as propose mechanisms to support those activities and systems at PAFA.

The top 5 words in the answers to the three supplemental questions were as follows:

Question 1: *“What types of activities/actions/policies should be introduced to help address diversity, equity, and inclusion at PAFA?”*

Answer: diversity (33), training (21), community (20), people (19), activities (15)

Question 2: *The second question, “How would you suggest PAFA allocates resources (time, people, funds) to achieve the diversity and inclusion goals to support the retention and advancement of staff, faculty, students?”*

Answer: diversity (38), people (22), resources (18), employee (17), support (16)

Question 3: *“How does leadership model open and transparent communication to foster a climate of acceptance and inclusivity?”*

Answer: leadership (35), communication (25), climate (19), diversity (18), inclusivity (17)

In a qualitative study, BELONGING believes that training and communication may be the interesting places to start data mining, since there are so many statements around communication and support and the need for bias, harassment, and management training.

Comparison Report

A total of 52 institutions participated in the HEDS Campus Climate Survey for 2018–2019. Schools with fewer than 4,000 students are designated “small schools,” while schools with over 4,000 students are designated “large schools.” There were 45 small schools and seven large schools participating in the HEDS survey (three schools conducted the survey twice). Of the 45 small schools that participated, only six had a student population under 1,000 and only three had a student population under 500, including PAFA. In fact, PAFA had the smallest student population out of the 52 participants. Of the 45 small schools, PAFA and the University of the Arts (UArts) in Philadelphia were the only AICAD schools. The difference in student population between PAFA and UArts is significant. UArts’s student population is six times greater than that of PAFA. Of the 45 small schools, only eight were located in cities with a population greater than 500,000 (Table 11).

After analyzing additional metrics for each institution, including student population, geographic location, city population, and racial/ethnic demographics of a city, which we believe influence lived experiences, BELONGING came to the conclusion that there were, in fact, no institutions comparable to PAFA. If BELONGING had to choose one, UArts would be the only comparable institution. In fall 2018, UArts launched DEI initiatives that included establishing a task force, defining DEI, releasing a DEI statement by the president and CEO, and centralizing DEI information and resources on their website.

As admirable as the UArts initiatives are, PAFA's task force strongly believes PAFA must pave its own path when navigating issues surrounding diversity, equity, and inclusion. PAFA is a unique institution that cannot and should not be compared to other institutions. We must not forget that PAFA has had a long history of inclusion at all levels of our institution: first female artists to exhibit in America (1811); first African American to exhibit in America (1834); first to allow women artists to draw from casts (1844); first part-time female faculty member at an art institution (1878); first renowned female professor at a co-educational art school (1895); and, more recently, PAFA was described as a pioneer in collecting works of art by historically underrepresented artists.

Final Summary

The initial survey carried out in spring 2019 must be followed by subsequent surveys. These surveys should take into consideration institutions with similar sizes and purposes to PAFA, while utilizing the baseline established by the initial survey to assess progress and other areas of concern, as well as areas of strength. In subsequent surveys, refinements should be made to try to glean the information most relevant to the institution, while bearing in mind that the goal is to not simply be in alignment with other peer institutions. Our objective is to try to establish an aspirational vision of what diversity, equity, and inclusion can be in the realm of art education, while, in the process, embodying the traditional role of PAFA as a leading institution within American art.

As a result, the committee should continue to reflect the different constituencies of PAFA's community, while also seeking to bring in and rotate committee members who can provide fresh perspectives and ideas on how to maintain the momentum and initiative set forth by the BELONGING Task Force. In this spirit, the recommendations and actions outlined above represent a starting point in an ongoing and long-term process of change, development, and responsiveness to the needs and support of the different stakeholders that make up PAFA's community. They reflect a larger progressive vision of how PAFA can build a pluralistic community that places an emphasis on valuing diversity, equity, and inclusion.

A brief summary of key accomplishments since the drafting of this report in the summer of 2019 are:

- Board adopted an institutional diversity statement in March 2020
- Board adopted the BELONGING Report in September 2020 after various Board and Executive Committee discussions in 2019-20.
- The hire of historically underrepresented individuals in Admissions, Student Services, and faculty roles, as well as the Director of Diversity, Equity, Inclusion, and Belonging & Deputy Title IX Coordinator.
- One BFA and one MFA student representative are now part of the School Committee.
- A policy prohibiting faculty-student and staff-student dating and fraternization has been instituted in the employee student handbook.
- All members of the Title IX Working Group have obtained Title IX certifications - <https://hr.pafa.org/policies/title-ix-vawa/working-group/>.
- Everfi was launched in May 2020, as PAFA's online provider for compliance training and education for faculty, staff, and students on mandatory topics such as Title IX, Diversity and Inclusion, Clery Act, and FERPA.
- New faculty search protocols implemented and a plan devised to get to 50% BIPOC among appointed faculty within 2.5 years. Two searches are launching for Spring 2021.
- The EthicsPoint hotline was expanded to online anonymous reporting in October 2019 - <http://pafa.ethicspoint.com/>.
- A faculty team was formed to create a diversity statement and mandatory reporting for Title IX to be added to syllabi.
- A new website was created as a central repository for policies and procedures at PAFA - <https://hr.pafa.org/policies/>.
- A new comprehensive Title IX policy published on August 14, 2020, and PAFA has updated its procedures accordingly. PAFA has also decided that it is equitable to apply these procedures to all prohibited sexual misconduct and harassment, whether it is "Title IX sexual misconduct" or not. - <https://hr.pafa.org/policies/title-ix-vawa/>.
- The minimum rate for hourly workers was raised to establish a living wage for all employees at PAFA.
- A dedicated lactation room was established in March 2020.
- All-gender restrooms in the Historic Landmark Building - new student restrooms in HLB are ADA compliant for the first time.
- PAFA began using Pingboard for its staff directory and organizational chart in October 2019 as a tool for transparency of reporting relationships and titles.
- Nell Irvin Painter was the most recent BIPOC Commencement Speaker for 2020.

- The hire of Senior VP of Marketing/Enrollment (identifies as Hispanic) [1 of 8 [12.5%] increases to 2 of 9 [22%] senior leaders).
- A Service Award Program was created in May 2019 to provide special recognition to faculty, staff, and administrators for their years of dedicated service and commitment. The program for 2020 was canceled due to the restriction of large gatherings due to COVID-19.

The key accomplishments listed in this report are not endpoints for considering the issues that impact each facet and stakeholder within PAFA's community. Rather, they represent an initial consideration of ways to reach the goal of a diverse, equitable, and inclusive environment at each level of the institution. In becoming a pluralistic community, it must be emphasized that such a vision is an ongoing process, one that has to be assessed and reconsidered on a regular basis through committee work and a formal assessment process.

Action Plan

This Action Plan is intended to be a living document that will be refined and updated by PAFA's standing committee on diversity, equity, and inclusion. The assumption is that PAFA will allocate resources to establish the appropriate infrastructure for implementation. The set of strategies and actions that have been developed are presented in the tables below, showing likely responsible parties and target implementation periods. The suggested timeline for implementation has been identified as immediate (up to 3 months), short-term (4 to 12 months), or long-term (13 months to 24 months).

Goal VI. PAFA Will Be Recognized as a Diverse and Inclusive Cultural Institution and Workplace.

Goal Statement

PAFA's Board of Trustees, faculty, staff, students, curriculum, exhibitions, collections, services, and programs will represent the breadth of the communities we serve.

Key Objectives

- PAFA's Board of Trustees and other volunteers (such as Women's Board, docents, etc.) reflect the communities we strive to serve
- PAFA's hiring, onboarding, professional development, training, and assessments embody best practices to attract and retain a diverse and inclusive faculty and staff
- PAFA's curriculum, exhibitions, programs, facilities, policies, and services reflect the needs and contributions of our region and nation's diverse composition to attract and retain a diverse and inclusive student body

Measurements of Success

- Creation of a diversity and inclusion taskforce
- Implementation of an institution-wide diversity plan
- ADA-accessible restrooms in the HLB
- All-gender restrooms in the Hamilton Building

Key Objective #1

PAFA's Board of Trustees and other volunteers (such as the Women's Board, docents, etc.) reflect the communities we strive to serve.

Tactics	Target Measures	Responsible Unit/Person	Timeline
1.1 Ensure commitment to diversity at the highest level of the institution through approval of this comprehensive Diversity Action Plan through a resolution of PAFA's Board of Trustees.	Diversity Action Plan approved and resolution approved by PAFA's Board of Trustees.	President & CEO	Short-term
1.2 Adopt a diversity statement with the level of significance as PAFA's Code of Ethics.	Diversity Statement approved and resolution approved by PAFA's Board of Trustees.	President & CEO	Short-term
1.3 Ensure prominent minorities are considered as part of ongoing awards of honorary degrees, outstanding alumni, and other prestigious awards.	Accolades awarded.	President & CEO/Chief Development Officer/Dean	Short-term
1.4 Commit time and resources to expand more diverse (in terms of gender, race, expertise, and background) leadership within our Board, staff, committee, and advisory bodies.	By the end of 2023, the makeup of the Board will match the diverse makeup of the student body. In doing so, this will create a closer alignment with the demographics of the city of Philadelphia.	President & CEO/Chairman	Long-term
1.5 Develop and prioritize a set of fundraising case statements to garner donations for key inclusion initiatives.	Increase scholarship availability and financial aid for underrepresented students.	President & CEO/Chief Development Officer	Short-term
1.6 Create opportunities for student representative on the School Committee, similar to the faculty representative.	Have a student representative to the School Committee.	President & CEO	Long-term
1.7 Pool resources and expand offerings for underrepresented constituents by connecting with other arts organizations committed to diversity and inclusion efforts.	Include a representative from other arts organizations committed to diversity and inclusion on each Board committee.	President & CEO, Museum Director, Dean of the School	Long-term
1.8 Create greater connectivity between Board members and the faculty, staff, and students.	Share a list of Board members, their photographs and their professional bios, with PAFA constituents on an annual basis. Send announcements of new Board members to faculty, staff, and students.	President & CEO/CMO	Immediate
1.9 Establish ways for Board members and PAFA constituents to interact.	Host annual event near convocation where the Board can meet the staff, faculty, and students.	President & CEO, Dean of School, Director of Museum	Short-term

Key Objective #2

PAFA's hiring, onboarding, professional development, training, and assessments embody best practices to attract and retain a diverse and inclusive faculty and staff.

Tactics	Target Measures	Responsible Unit/ Person	Timeline
2.1 Incorporate diversity as a performance measure within the faculty, staff, and student employee performance evaluation process.	How well the employees support and promote diversity, equity, and inclusion in their work.	Vice President of Human Resources/ Dean of the School	Immediate
2.2 Expand the diversity calendar of events, celebrations, historic dates, and holidays to include the student body.	Calendar published.	Vice President of Human Resources/ Dean of Students	Immediate
2.3 Establish Belonging as a standing committee on diversity, equity, and inclusion with an identified charge and term limits.	Committee created and functioning.	President & CEO/ Vice President of Human Resources	Immediate
2.4 Create a diversity and inclusion position; DEI Coordinator.	Creation of position and person hired.	President & CEO/ Vice President of Human Resources	Long-term
2.5 Create a required diversity workshop, "The Heritage of Diversity and Inclusion at PAFA," for all new and current faculty and staff.	Workshop offered every fall, beginning fall 2020.	Vice President of Human Resources	Short-term
2.6 Incorporate diversity speakers into the PAFA Speakers Series.	Prominent multi-cultural speakers visit campus as part of professional development workshops.	Vice President of Human Resources/ Chief Marketing Officer	Short-term
2.7 Conduct a biennial Diversity and Equity Survey to monitor progress toward creating an inclusive environment, publicizing all data and findings, and comparing results to baseline data to make additional recommendations.	Survey instruments developed, data collected, and reports published and disseminated on benchmarks developed by the committee. Develop a written annual DEI report that addresses progress within each theme. Develop progress calendar and other reporting methods as needed.	Vice President of Human Resources/ DEI Coordinator	Long-term
2.8 Develop plans to improve number and percentage of historically underrepresented faculty.	Develop an education module for all search committees regarding diversity and inclusion for hiring.	Dean of School	Short-term and Long-term
2.9 Pursue cultural competency throughout our organization by creating substantive learning opportunities and formal, transparent policies.	Identify policies and practices that currently hinder access and inclusivity for underrepresented students and employees and make changes to address such policies and practices.	Vice President of Human Resources/DEI Coordinator	Long-term
2.10 Identify and allocate resources to diversity and inclusion experiences for faculty.	Develop a faculty and staff professional development on inclusion pedagogy, specifically inclusive course design.	Dean of the School/ Vice President of Human Resources	Long-term

Tactics	Target Measures	Responsible Unit/ Person	Timeline
2.11 Create and publish compensation and reporting structures, incentives, rewards in performance, and promotion for faculty and staff, to enhance fair and equitable pay practices.	Clear policies and practices on reclassifications and annual merit. Budget allocation for paid internships.	Vice President of Human Resources	Long-term
2.12 Recruit senior leadership from diverse backgrounds and lived experiences.	Applicants for leadership positions demonstrate a commitment to diversity and inclusion.	President & CEO	Immediate

Key Objective #3:

PAFA's curriculum, exhibitions, programs, facilities, policies, and services reflect the needs and contributions or our region and nation's diverse composition to attract and retain a diverse and inclusive student body.

Tactics	Target Measures	Responsible Unit/ Person	Timeline
3.1 Thread PAFA's core values throughout all communication materials (signage, collateral, website, social media campaigns), student programming, professional development, and meetings.	All constituents, including the public, should be able to articulate and identify PAFA's core values.	President & CEO/Chief Marketing Officer	Long-term
3.2 Add DEI statement on course syllabi to signal commitment to creating an inclusive and supportive climate for all students: accommodations for disabilities and various learning styles, course discipline design, and accessible course materials.	DEI and accessibility reflected in course material.	Dean of School	Immediate
3.3 Increase collaboration among student organizations by assessing events of student groups, identifying events with similar themes, and encouraging collaboration and involvement across student groups.	Successful intra-group collaborative programming.	Dean of Students	Short-term
3.4 Ensure PAFA facilities are ADA compliant, accessible, and safe by conducting annual tour of campus and reviewing policies and procedures. Training for key staff.	Facilities are reviewed annually and action plans initiated. Internal constituents understand policies, procedures, access.	President & CEO/ Director of Facilities	Long-term
3.5 Build new and/or retrofit existing facilities and amenities for family inclusive and unisex bathrooms, changing stations, and designated nursing spaces (staff, student, public).	New and/or improved facilities.	Director of Facilities	Short-term
3.6 All marketing and communication messaging in print, digital, web and video developed at PAFA should reflect the diversity of the campus as well as promoting inclusion through accessibility. Also, ensure PAFA's diversity statement is included on print materials where appropriate.	Promotional materials reflect diversity. Stakeholders have an increased understanding of the cultural climate and community experience.	Chief Marketing Officer	Immediate

Tactics	Target Measures	Responsible Unit/ Person	Timeline
<p>3.7 Establish realistic and manageable goals for school and museum project collaboration: exhibition production, curriculum, programming, onsite resources.</p>	<p>Increase internal utilization of school/museum resources, streamlined communications; increase engagement across institution.</p>	<p>Museum Director/ Dean of School</p>	<p>Short-term</p>
<p>3.8 Build educational support services. Communicate details of current educational support services.</p>	<p>Increased use of support services, improved student performance and retention. Reestablish Director of Academic Services role.</p>	<p>Dean of Students</p>	<p>Short-term</p>
<p>3.9 Improve communications and support for international students regarding finances, ESL, access to services, travel, and legal precedence.</p>	<p>Develop central repository for resource information, alignment of support staff,</p>	<p>Dean of Students</p>	<p>Immediate</p>